

THE HAMILTON PROJECT

Public-Private Partnerships to Revamp U.S. Infrastructure



Eduardo Engel - Yale University
Ronald Fischer - University of Chile in Santiago
Alexander Galetovic - Universidad de los Andes in Santiago

Public-Private Partnerships in Brief

- Private partner is responsible for both the construction phase and operation/maintenance phases of a project.
- Temporary ownership, large initial investment
- Key strength of PPPs is the incentive they create to minimize project life-cycle costs.
- Common problems with PPPs: demand uncertainty, renegotiations, government overspending

Dulles Greenway / Orange County 91 Express Lanes

Dulles Greenway (Virginia)

- 12.5 mile road, joins Leesburg bypass to the Dulles Toll Road,
- Opened in 1995 with 40 year concession

Demand failed to meet expectations

- Virginia widened Route 7 (untolled)
 - Concessionaire defaulted in 1999
 - Contract renegotiated: term extended to 60 years

Orange County 91 Express Lanes (California)

- \$130 million project -- ten-mile electronically tolled corridor along a congested route
- Opened in 1995, 35-year franchise

Stuck in traffic for years because of non compete clause

- 1999: need for additional public lanes
 - Non-compete clause prevented capacity increase
 - Four year conflict: fair compensation?
 - Finally bought out in 2003 for \$207 million

When to Use PPPs?

Wrong Reason:

- Relief for government budgets

Right Reasons:

- Screen bad projects:
 - if financed via user fees
 - and no renegotiations
- Avoids charging unrealistically low user fees
- Better and cheaper maintenance

How to Use PPPs?

Governance:

- Separate selecting/awarding projects from enforcing contracts
- Ensure that renegotiations are ‘profit neutral’

Budgetary Accounting

- PPPs should count as public debt: avoids “selling the future”

Designing the contract:

- Present-value-of-revenue (PVR) contracts and auctions
 - lower risk premium
 - Dulles: would have avoided default and renegotiations
 - Orange County Express Lanes: no 4 years of negotiations
 - avoids need for non-compete clause

Large Numbers

- **Transport PPP investment, average annual growth:**
 - 2006-2009: 14.5%
 - 2005-2009 or 2004-2009: much higher
- **Annual transport PPP investment by 2020:**
 - \$34.1 billion: “conservative”, could be 10 times higher
- **U.S. Maintenance Deficit:** \$2.2 trillion
- **PVR contracts:**
 - reduction in risk premium: 33%
 - better and cheaper maintenance
 - fewer renegotiations → select more efficient firms